

## ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW **MINUTES**

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street Monday, October 5, 2009

3:00 P.M.

**BOARD MEMBERS:** 

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - PRESENT

DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT CLAY AURELL - PRESENT @ 3:06 P.M.

CAROL GROSS – PRESENT @ 3:15 P.M. UNTIL 4:55 P.M.

GARY MOSEL - PRESENT PAUL ZINK - PRESENT

CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND - PRESENT

KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT @ 3:24 P.M. **STAFF:** 

> MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

### Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)  Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.  Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.  Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing)  Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.  Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.  Plans - floor, roof, etc.  Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions:  Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.  Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.  Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

#### PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at <a href="www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr">www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr</a>. Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at <a href="mailto:mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov">mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov</a>. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

#### **LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

#### **NOTICE:**

- 1. That on Thursday, October 1, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
- 2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <a href="http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/">http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/</a> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at <a href="https://www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr">www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr</a> and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

### CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.

## **ROLL CALL:**

Members present: Manson-Hing, Sherry, Mosel, Zink, Gross (present @ 3:15 p.m. until 4:55 p.m.), Aurell

(present @ 3:06 p.m.), Rivera, and Gilliland.

Members absent: None.

#### **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September 21, 2009**,

2009, as submitted.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Aurell absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 28, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by

Clay Aurell, with additional landscaping review by Carol Gross.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 6/0/0, Motion carried. (Gross/Aurell absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of October 5, 2009. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gary

Mosel.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained, Gross absent.)

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
  - 1) Board member Gross announced that she will be leaving the meeting early after review of agenda Item #3, 421 N. Milpas Street.
  - 2) Board member Zink announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #3, 421 N. Milpas Street.
  - 3) Board member Rivera announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #3, 421 N. Milpas Street, and agenda Item #4, 312 Rancheria Street.
  - 4) Board member Gilliland announced that he will be stepping down from agenda Item #5, 421 E. Cota Street.
- E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**

1. 3222 STATE ST C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-332-031 Application Number: MST2009-00377

Owner: Anthony Osehan and Yani Trustees

Applicant: Chris Sewell

(Proposal for a conceptual review for a minor facade remodel at the Agave Inn to include an "as-built" wood decorative element along the street facade and an "as-built" exterior color change.)

### (Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(3:08)

Present: Chris Sewell, Applicant; and Kenny Osehan; Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:28 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

## **Motion:** Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

1) Carry forward all previous comments from Sept. 8<sup>th</sup> review, except the previous Comment #1, as stated: #2. Eliminate the portion of the "trellis element" at the gable roof (above the plate). #3. Repaint the areas of yellow paint with the "calico rock" color for the window and door trim and the guardrail, as suggested. #4. Resolve the corner condition of the "trellis element" at the pedestrian entry by adding a vertical trim piece, as suggested. #5. Provide an embellished landscape plan that would compliment the architecture (as stated below). #6. Provide a more earth tone color or texture for the concrete planter or paint it the same color as the exterior plaster.

#### LANDSCAPING:

- 1) Relocate the Agave plant to another location on the property, it may be potted, and replace with pencil tree (Euphorbia tirucalli), tall thin succulents for fill, which will not interfere with the existing signage.
- 2) Use Soft Agave (Agave attenuata) behind Dymondia margaretae, and plant Flax (Phormium 'Bronze Baby') in northeast corner of planter.

Action: Sherry/Rivera, 6/0/2. Motion carried. (Zink/Mosel abstained).

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

#### 2. 903 W MISSION ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-113-009
Application Number: MST2009-00388
Owner: Kenneth and Heidi Harbaugh

Architect: Marc Perry Architect

Applicant: Tarah Brown

(Proposal to construct a new 555 square foot second story accessory dwelling unit above a new 636 square foot three-car garage on a 5,000 square foot lot. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing 315 square foot non-conforming garage, a 38 square foot addition and a new 61 square foot covered porch to the existing main residence. The project will result in an 854 square foot main residence, a 555 square foot new accessory dwelling unit and a new 636 square foot three-car garage. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested zoning modification to provide less than the required 600 square feet of open yard.)

#### (Comments Only; Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

(3:30)

Present: Tarah Brown, Applicant; Marc Perry, Architect; and Heidi Harbaugh, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

#### **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board understands the constraints involved with corner lots; however, the Board feels the project is moving in the wrong direction as it lacks compatibility with both the existing house and the neighborhood.
- 2) Study the overall style for a design that is compatible in style, massing, and materials, and provides neighborhood compatibility and continuity of style throughout the project.
- 3) Provide an entrance to the second unit that incorporates a pedestrian street presence and neighborhood compatibility.
- **4)** Study the proposed fencing and material to be more compatible with the overall style of the house and neighborhood.
- 5) The Board finds the proposed curb cut to be excessive in length and would prefer to have it minimized. Verify the length of the proposed curb cut with the Transportation Division staff and if possible revise to reduce the length.
- 6) The Board reserves their comments on the modification at this time pending the above items, as the project has not reached the appropriate project threshold.

Action: Sherry/Gross, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

3. 421 N MILPAS ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-303-021 Application Number: MST2009-00393

Owner: Darrell Becker Architect: Burnell & Jewett

(The proposal includes the conversion of the existing 838 square foot second floor residential unit to commercial space, the demolition of an existing 515 square foot residential unit, and construction of a new 236 square foot detached office building on a 4,590 square foot lot. The project also includes three new uncovered parking spaces and a new wall and gates along the south property line. The project requires Development Plan Approval Findings by the Architectural Board of Review for 1,074 square feet of new commercial square footage. There are two existing commercial units, totaling 1,528 square feet, on the first floor which are proposed to remain. The project received ABR approval on 8/24/09 for a façade remodel to the existing mixed-use building. The proposal will abate violations outlined in ENF2009-00971.)

## (Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval.)

(4:35)

Present: Brett Jewett & Tracy Burnell, Architects; Derrik Eichelberger, Landscape Architect; and

Darrell Becker, Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with comments:

- 1) The Project is ready for Preliminary Approval with Development Plan Approval Findings.
- 2) Applicant to provide appropriate detailing to Consent.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera/Zink stepped down).

\*\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED AT 4:55 P.M. AND RECOVENED AT 4:56 P.M. \*\*\*

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**

4. 312 RANCHERIA ST R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-231-010 Application Number: MST2005-00634

Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

Owner: Rancheria Cottages, LLC

(A revised architectural style for the proposal to construct five, two-story, attached residential condominiums on an 11,375 square foot lot in the R-4 Zone. The proposal will consist of four two-bedroom units and one one-bedroom unit and vary in size from 991 to 1,104 square feet for a combined total of 5,407 square feet of living area. Each unit will have an attached two-car garage for a combined garage total of 2,230 square feet. The proposal includes 243 cubic yards of cut and fill and demolition of the two existing residential units and three storage sheds. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification to allow the front entry porch to extend into the required 10 foot front setback. The project received Planning Commission approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map on 7/13/06 (Resolution No. 029-06) and a time extension by the Staff Hearing Officer on 7/16/08 (Resolution No. 058-08).)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires a Substantial Conformance Determination, Staff Hearing Officer review for a requested modification, and compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-06 and Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 058-08.)

(4:57)

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

### **Motion:** Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The project is going in right direction.
- 2) Where the plate heights are the same, make the headers of window and sills the same height.
- 3) Provide a more compatible surface material at the driveway to help break up the pedestrian and driveway areas.
- 4) Relocate the chimney closest to the street so the alignment is not over the cantilevered portion of the second floor.
- 5) Increase the planters at the garage doors to the maximum possible depth.
- **6**) Study building out the second floor gable windows 8 to 10 inches out from the face of the walls.
- 7) Look for ways to individualize the units by possibly using different colors and/or shutter designs.

Action: Gilliland/Sherry, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Rivera stepped down, Gross absent.)

#### PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 421 E COTA ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-010 Application Number: MST2009-00250

Owner: Transition House
Architect: Mark Wienke
Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal to demolish the existing 7,566 square foot two-story mixed-use building and construct a new 9,142 square foot two-story mixed-use building, comprising of 8 affordable residential apartments (six, two-bedroom and two, three-bedroom units, totaling 7,208 square feet) and a 1,934 square foot day care center. The existing 14,080 square foot, two-story mixed use building, comprised of 8 residential apartments (6,175 square feet) and 7,905 commercial square feet, will remain. A total of 715 cubic yards of grading is proposed. The parcel will result in two two-story mixed-use buildings, with a combined total of 16 affordable apartments (13,383 residential square feet) and 9,839 commercial square feet, on a 42,221 square foot lot. A total of 37 uncovered parking spaces are proposed. The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval on 8/12/09 (Resolution No. 070-09) for a requested zoning modification for a reduction of the required parking.)

# (Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution 070-09.)

(5:24)

Present: Mark Wienke, Architect; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 5:34 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

**Motion:** Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board prefers the proposed option which incorporates a wall with arched entry providing more of an enclosed forecourt.
- 2) Project is consistent with the Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 070-09.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland stepped down, Gross absent.)

#### **ADJOURNMENT:**

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

#### **NEW ITEM**

#### A. 616 EUCALYPTUS AVE

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-050-016 Application Number: MST2009-00430

Owner: De La Mora Salvadore & Soledad Trust

Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct a six foot sandstone color block wall, for a distance of 45 linear feet, at the rear of an existing multi-family apartment building. No other alterations are proposed.)

### (Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

#### **Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**

- 1. Supports the project and materials, but would prefer to see a rounded cap on the CMU wall.
- 2. Add vine pockets at the new sandstone wall.

### **NEW ITEM**

B. 126 E HALEY ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-026 Application Number: MST2009-00433

Owner: 417 Santa Barbara Street Investment

Architect: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal to enclose a parking lot with a new 7 foot tall black chain link fence and access gates for security purposes. No other alterations proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with the condition that the fence shall be 6 feet in height.

#### **NEW ITEM**

#### C. 140 S HOPE AVE A-4

C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-007 Application Number: MST2009-00394 Owner: Riviera Dairy Products

Architect: Arc Vision, Inc.
Applicant: Greg Miller

(Proposal for a facade remodel to an existing 1,215 square foot tenant space at La Cumbre Plaza. The remodel will result in a 26 square foot addition. All signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate Sign application.)

## (Project requires compliance with the La Cumbre Tenant Design Criteria.)

### **Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:**

- 1. Study the La Cumbre Tenant Design Criteria and incorporate a design that will include the parapet to give the store front its own identity.
- 2. Incorporate a natural stone or tile base at the knee wall.
- 3. Include the proposed entry way tile and the terminus with the existing mall sidewalk.
- **4.** All signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.

## **CONTINUED ITEM**

D. 336 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-371-021
Application Number: MST2006-00236
Owner: Unterman Family Trust
Architect: Perkowitz & Ruth Architects

(Proposal for a new one-story 12,121 square foot commercial building and a 49 space parking lot for Fresh and Easy Neighborhood Market. The proposal includes the voluntary merger of three lots totaling 39,130 square feet, and demolition of three existing non-residential buildings totaling 12,919 square feet resulting in a credit of 798 commercial square feet.)

(Preliminary Approval was granted 10/9/2006. Two one-year time extensions have been granted. Applicant is requesting a third one-year time extension.)

Approval of a one-year time extension with findings made that there are no changes proposed to the original design that received Preliminary Approval.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Gary Mosel.